

Interview with Cy Logar (full panel)
2/29/08, 10 a.m.
753 Engineering Sciences Building

Roy Nutter: Explained Jan Boyles' role as recorder. Also explained that information may be made public through Freedom of Information Act requests. Asked for background information from Logar.

Cy Logar: I came to WVU in 1976 as an assistant professor of marketing. In the early 1980s, I was first chair of the department of marketing. I served for a few years as the interim director of the management department. I became the associate dean under Art Craft. In 1987, I served as dean of the college. I was in that position for six years. I returned to the faculty. Some personal issues came up, and an opportunity arose when the associate dean stepped down. I applied for that position, and have been in that position for four years.

John Burkoff: When did you first hear of Heather Bresch's issues?

CL: Someone put a newspaper article on my desk.

JB: Then what? All hell broke loose?

CL: I don't know what was going on...

RN: Which article are you talking about?

CL: The long article that ran in the Post-Gazette that said she did not have her degree. It was back in October. I'm not sure of the exact date. The dean's secretary gave to me.

Michael Lastinger: You mean the article was in October that said she didn't have her degree?

CL: Some information came out...

Art Centonze: Was this the date of the advisory board meeting?

CL: You're asking me dates...

JB: Was this matter treated as just an ordinary run of the mill one?

CL: Let me give you an example. A student comes in – says I didn't graduate. I ask, 'What happened? You didn't apply for graduation.' It just happened a few months ago – just something that came up – I have no idea who the individual is – it was something that came down.

JB: But most things are not in the Post-Gazette.

CL: Maybe I'm wrong in terms of what – I don't have this all documented. All I know is I read a newspaper article and a meeting was called.

JB: When was this?

CL: Back in October. I don't recall that day.

JB: Who was at that meeting?

AC: Did you inform the dean [about the matter]?

CL: The dean said there was going to be a meeting. Information was given to me that she did not have a degree – I was told what had transpired. But before that meeting – the big meeting – was a meeting that Jerry Lang had called – me, Blakely were invited to that meeting.

Lori Franz: Along with the dean?

CL: The dean was not there. Craig Walker came into the meeting at one point. It was in his office. At some point, Alex Macia also came in.

JB: What happened at the meeting?

CL: Jerry [Blakely] had collected information with regard to the student. Jerry Lang had collected some information. There was an assumption that this had occurred – that someone in Stewart Hall had been notified. Two of us were called over. The Provost started asking questions – had we looked at the transcript? Had we looked at fees? What did we know about it? We didn't know anything about it. Both of us, in essence -- Jerry [Blakely] had come into position in July/August. He had been on the faculty through the eMBA program. He shared information on the number of incompletes – he basically said, we don't know anything – we need to look and see what you're talking about here.

AC: You and College of Business had not done any investigation prior to this meeting?

CL: I don't know.

AC: Did you ask him [Blakely] to?

CL: We needed information. We needed to go back and get information. We needed access to all the files. We were asked to gather the information that you have. I don't have the exact chronology. It was after Jerry's [Lang's] meeting.

JB: So what happens at that first meeting?

CL: There was discussion – We don't know. This is news to us. We don't have the information. I can't remember exactly if Craig Walker came into the meeting, but he indicated that he had talked with Paul Speaker, because Paul Speaker was the director of the program. He called them or had in call into them. I'm not sure whether he had talked to them or not.

JB: Did he report to you on any conversations with Heather Bresch?

CL: I didn't know until after that. A second meeting was called. Jerry went through, asked 'Can you find out whatever you can find out?'

LF: At the time of this first meeting, what transpired between the dean and you and Jerry? What were the implications for the college about the scrutiny of the degree?

CL: I had no idea who the person was.

LF: But it was in the paper.

CL: At the point when they brought it out as the governor's daughter, it was apparent this is going to get a lot of attention. But in terms of any discussion, our discussion was does anybody know anything about this. I was the new kid on the block. The university needs a decision.

JB: So you tasked Blakely with finding out information?

CL: The dean did.

JB: I thought you said you did.

CL: That's what Sears told them – look into it. Here's a situation that occurred. He said, 'Jerry, you need to look into it.' At some point, I'm not sure what it was, he was asking questions in regard to the dean – I don't have the timetable – but the dean did come out with a formal request that Jerry and I look into this – go back and look at all the files.

JB: This is before the second meeting?

CL: I'm not sure.

AC: The dean said it was after.

CL: I'm guessing it occurred after. We don't have enough information about anything.

LF: In your conversations with the dean and Jerry Blakely, was it discussed that Mylan was a big donor to the college?

CL: There was no discussion whatsoever. I made a comment that I looked at this. 'Something is not right here. Why is this all happening the way it is?' When you're around for a while, you see things happening – it's strange. We had not had discussions with reference with Mylan being a big donor. They weren't a big donor to the college.

LF: Do most people in the college know who the donors are?

ML: They're not a big donor to the college?

CL: Mylan's money went to football.

ML: What is your dean's title?

CL: The Mylan Puskar dean.

LF: Do faculty have information about donors to the college?

CL: I can't answer for faculty.

LF: Would administration?

CL: Administration would have a good idea.

JB: So you looked at what records you could find. Did you share with Dean Sears?

CL: We got the information that we had. I brought back what Jerry Blakely had. I'm not sure that information had been collected before the next meeting was called.

JB: Was this the big meeting? Was a decision made about whether she earned the degree or not?

CL: In my opinion, the decision was that she had completed the requirements. It occurred at the big meeting.

CL: When we got back, it was said, 'Jerry, you need to get that information.' Another meeting was called within a day – went over with such and such...

JB: Was this meeting held at Stewart Hall?

CL: Yes.

LF: Do you often have people in the college meet with people like Craig Walker?

CL: Jerry Lang and I came here together. We were deans together. I see him all the time. It's not unusual. The dean has regular meetings with him. Jerry Blakely – I would doubt that he would have regular meetings. I've known Craig Walker for years.

RN: How do you know him?

CL: He used to be with the athletic department, then the Foundation. Morgantown's not a major metro area. My wife taught school. Craig Walker's wife was on the school board.

LF: Did you talk about the matter with him casually?

CL: Nope.

JB: Who was at the Stewart Hall meeting?

CL: Craig Walker, Paul Speaker, Jerry Lang, Alex Macia, Bill Case, Steve Sears, Jerry Blakely, myself.

RN: Paul Speaker?

CL: Paul Speaker was there.

LF: Was a decision made at that meeting?

CL: In my personal mind.

JB: Based on what? What was the basis?

CL: There were questions asked of Paul Speaker ranging from – what did they find out about the program? This student was in the program when I first began. They offered 1 credit courses – all special topics. It was a hodgepodge created back then. There were several questions of Paul Speaker, and these questions came from some of the questions Jerry Lang had asked Jerry Blakely and myself in that meeting. [REDACTED] How come so many? [REDACTED] They asked Paul about [REDACTED], and I don't recall all of the questions. Several questions were asked in Paul's response. The dean asked him questions. The response that came from Jerry – for example [REDACTED] – payment was a problem at that time. The system didn't have in place a mechanism to bill the student with regard to courses to give student credit for...

ML: Do you remember how many Is?

CL: I can't remember. His comment was at that time, the format that was used for changing grades from [REDACTED] -- a faculty member would complete the form and it would go to a Dean. He indicated a dean didn't process and many things got lost.

AC: Did you see a copy of her transcript prior to that meeting?

CL: No. I'm there because I'm the associate dean.

AC: Not responsible for eMBA?

JB: Did you see a copy at that meeting?

CL: No. We were talking generally. They were asking Paul questions.

AC: You describe Paul as the focal point. Did he have a lot to say?

CL: He was the director of the program. He was there to give his impression of how he does things. Paul's management style is I'm going to tell you what you want to hear – don't worry about that – we'll take care of it. That's Paul's behavior. It didn't strike me as it did as some -- waiving courses – Paul operated that way. Questions were asked of Paul – questions that Jerry Lang had asked Blakely and myself.

JB: Do you recall Paul saying that he had met with Heather Bresch and they had agreed on a workout plan as to what was to happen then?

CL: That, I don't recall. We were trying to identify courses and see if they had been completed.

LF: At the meeting?

CL: Yes. They were asking Paul to give information – all information that came to us from him – like the reason for the [REDACTED]. He gave her credit for [REDACTED]. I know she had credit for these courses completed. [REDACTED] had not been turned in by these individuals. Here's a person that had a very busy schedule and someone had worked with her to accommodate that schedule. Is there a – was there a – mentioned workout list – list available for everyone? We don't have a list. Where is that list? We don't have it. He was asked about graduation. He told her she could go through graduation.

JB: Do you remember if Craig Walker gave a hearsay report of conversations with Heather Bresch?

CL: Craig Walker said he had talked with Heather Bresch. He indicated in this luncheon conversation, she and this other student...

JB: Leah Summers.

CL: Leah Summers. She had met degree requirements.

JB: Do you recall Paul Speaker saying that was not his recollection of the meeting?

CL: No. If Paul would have said, she did not complete the degree and she did not graduate, she did not do any of this – I would have never said in my opinion that she

completed it. After Craig Walker made that comment, Alex Macia made a comment that, 'It looks like she completed the requirements.' Everyone agreed and no one objected.

RN: Was this conclusion drawn by Macia?

RN: Were you asked [your thoughts]?

CL: Lang went around the room. Based on the conversations with Craig and Paul, we didn't have any evidence.

ML: So Paul Speaker stops speaking. The [redacted] are explained. There are two types of work: credits for work done and credit not given. At that point, Craig Walker says thank you because you are agreeing it is finished?

CL: I didn't hear Craig Walker complete that.

ML: Paul Speaker said she had said that she finished all the work?

CL: He explained and answered the questions that were asked. These are the problems with the [redacted] with the [redacted] – I know these classes were completed for her – There should be a workout plan – I did have lunch with her and Leah Summers.

ML: If she didn't complete it, there would be a workout plan?

CL: If she didn't complete it, there should be a workout plan, he said.

LF: So you went through all these credits. There's still [redacted] Did someone ask about [redacted]

CL: Nobody asked about those [redacted]. Did she complete all the [redacted] All these courses? There was no workout plan. To my recollection, I don't recall the specific number of hours asked. In the paper, it said [redacted]. It doesn't make sense – nobody's going to let anyone go through graduation with [redacted]. It was asked what kinds of things happened.

LF: At some point, I think there's another six hours, but then, aside from that – there's still another [redacted] with no registration [redacted]. No one brought that up?

CL: No one brought it up. When questions were asked of Paul -- Can we account for all of this coursework? I'm not sure whether he explained all the credits or not.

LF: Did people at the meeting show what credits had been earned?

CL: We were listening to the director of the program who was in charge. We were looking for his direction.

JB: Do you recall if one of the [REDACTED] involved [REDACTED]'s class?

CL: Yes.

CL: [REDACTED] made the following comment – knew he had her for class, but he didn't know if [REDACTED], and didn't know he had [REDACTED]. I said, 'What are you telling me? Someone else [REDACTED]' He said, 'I know she had [REDACTED]'

JB: Was that before or after the meeting?

CL: I don't know.

JB: So the issue was not Speaker. Blakely was talking about his own I?

CL: It could have been completed, and he said, 'I just don't remember at that point in time.' The files were changed. They got rid of files.

JB: After Alex Macia says his comment, did Sears make an ultimate statement that the degree had been completed?

CL: I don't recall who it was exactly. Macia asked, 'Does anyone have any problems with that?'

ML: Between when Paul Speaker stops speaking and the time between Alex Macia starts speaking – what happened?

CL: Craig Walker came in. He said he had called Heather Bresch, and that the student informed me...and confirmed that she had met the requirements.

ML: Was that in concordance with what Paul Speaker had stated?

CL: Paul Speaker was justifying what happened to the [REDACTED], money. The COB later found a list that had her as an alumna from Mylan.

ML: Did you look at all the names on that list?

CL: Not at the time.

ML: Do you remember what the list looks like?

CL: I saw a list much later when I was asked for information. But after he made his comment, he went around the room – Lang. It was stated, it looks like she completed – and nobody objected.

JB: So you don't recall it as a close case, but the tie should go to the student?

CL: I don't have all the facts. It's not clean. His philosophy is – do we go with the student or against them?

AC: Is there a sense that another week or two weeks would have allowed for more conclusive evidence?

CL: Everything we have been able to find since then confirms what we thought was the right decision.

AC: Which is...

CL: With the change in administration, we no longer had [eMBA] students coming to me with promises from Paul Speaker. Another faculty member came in – Dieter Schaupp – and told me that back then faculty were paid \$300 when students were working and couldn't get course completed. They would offer the course as an independent study.

AC: Is that what happened with Heather Bresch?

CL: I'm not sure.

RN: Do you feel you were under pressure to make a decision at that meeting?

CL: I think we could have waited two weeks or a month. We could have waited anytime on it. Any student who comes to me – if they come to me and said, 'I thought I was graduating and didn't,' I'm not going to tell them – 'I'll get back to it in two months.'

JB: I don't understand your answer.

CL: I think the situation anytime it's related to a student – I think I need to respond as quickly as I can.

AC: If there was another student, would there have been a meeting with Craig Walker, Macia, Lang and Sears or did people think this was a special case?

CL: Very good question. Probably not, unless, well, the past president created an environment of student orientation. Parents no longer go to the dean, they go to Stewart Hall for information. It's been happening over the past few years.

AC: When the decision was made to move forward and for her to earn the degree, what was the basis for adding courses and assigning grades on the transcript?

CL: Jerry Blakely tried to take from the conversation in that meeting – he tried to go back and look at [REDACTED] that they hadn't been turned in and they should have been turned in. These were [REDACTED] courses – [REDACTED] courses. There is now a third set of courses

now in place. What Jerry did – was take all of this – and convert into what are the numbers we have today.

ML: Under whose instruction?

CL: The dean. He needed to reconstruct the records. Jerry Blakely went back and did the reconstruction.

LF: Why was Paul Speaker not involved in the reconstruction?

CL: Paul Speaker was working with Jerry Blakely, I was told. Another student had similar problems. I assumed he talked with Paul.

AC: Where did the grades come from?

JB: From the courses that were added this fall?

CL: From what Jerry Blakely told me, after he reconstructed it was, like, – well, I just put the grades in there – it was a flip of a coin.

AC: You were satisfied with that?

CL: Yeah, I was satisfied with that.

AC: Why?

CL: There was no basis to determine other than what was given to me. Jerry tried to contact the faculty.

JB: But he knew from the meeting that she wasn't taking classes.

CL: It was a set of classes different from...

LF: What about [REDACTED]? There's a void on the transcript. How did you reconstruct that?

CL: I didn't reconstruct. Jerry Blakely did.

JB: If she was getting life credit, how did that translate into actual courses with grades assigned by a flip of the coin?

CL: If she completed – she was told she had met the graduation requirements and would need [REDACTED]

JB: Was there a discussion of her GPA?

CL: No.

JB: Did you take look at her GPA?

CL: No. You asked me a question – I called a friend of mine who was [REDACTED] – he wasn't home. His wife answered the phone. She happened to be in the same class with this student and she started talking to me about it. She said, 'I'm going to tell you.' And I said, 'I'll listen.' She [REDACTED] was very upset with the treatment that the student [Bresch] was receiving and she [Bresch] made the comment to me [REDACTED] – I've got to travel, but Speaker said I'll give you a paper and I'll take care of it for you. Now 10 years later, these are the kind of things...

ML: Can you identify the person?

CL: [REDACTED].

ML: That's the e-mail we looked at yesterday.

LF: There's the inference that Paul Speaker played fast and loose with giving credit. The mechanism for life credit isn't the mechanism for an independent study. Wouldn't the student still have to sign up, be given a grade. An I is cleared up by alternate assignments. How do you explain the lack of independent studies?

CL: I can't explain. There are other students who graduated from the program with less than 48 hours.

AC: Including transfer credit?

CL: Jerry Blakely looked at these people.

ML: How much less than 48 hours?

CL: It doesn't make a difference.

LF: [REDACTED]

CL: If the rule says 48, it's 48. I'm sitting there and I'm saying why is this happening? We gave some students credit for courses in music, and I'm thinking, what is going on? I don't know where this came from. I don't know how he did it.

LF: So is that not 48 hours, or not credits that meet the requirements?

CL: Meet the requirements.

LF: It depends on what they're doing [with the degree].

CL: Here's my question that I don't have an answer to. We have a lockstep program – you start at this time, you take these courses; you take those courses; you have 48 hours; you graduate. Why would other courses be substituted for it? I have that question in my own mind. Why is somebody giving credit for music, because somewhere within those hours, you have to take accounting, economics, marketing. How did those courses get [counted as] requirements that should be covered in music?

JB: Was this raised at the October meeting?

CL: No. We are collecting information now.

JB: We know about Heather and [REDACTED].

ML: If Heather and [REDACTED]...if you hold them together, are they going to look alike?

CL: Somehow [REDACTED] case got resolved.

JB: Did you know that at the Oct. 15 meeting?

CL: I heard there was another case, but don't recall at what point. In the [REDACTED] case, it was changed.

LF: According to the dean, there were lots of students who had these same kind of problems, had incompletes in classes.

AC: When the decision was made to grant the degree retroactively, do you remember Paul Speaker saying, 'That's the one thing we know that did not happen'?

CL: If that was said, then I would not have said that you have completed your degree.

LF: You would not have approved it at that point in time. Have you ever known of a student who would be allowed to walk through graduation and under what circumstances?

CL: There are two scenarios. The first: an undergrad student has a course to pick up in the summer. There is no graduation ceremony in the summer. It is very clear that students can walk through it. That doesn't mean that you graduated. There's another situation that if I have an I in a course, and we know that they are working on it, and I didn't finish in spring semester, they would be permitted to walk through that ceremony. We had an example with one where the student in industrial relations was taking an internship and was having graduation in the summer. The internship didn't end until October. Those are the types of situations where we have permitted students to go through graduation.

LF: Is that a positive thing for students in the eMBA program with incompletes to walk with their cohort because it's a cohort-based program?

CL: It would be a reason. If you're talking [REDACTED], I would say absolutely not – If you're talking a whole semester's worth of coursework – If this is a student who has an incomplete that we're finishing up. If it's missed, they can wait until it comes around again unless some arrangement is made. To graduate with the class, if you're very close – I mean, I describe what close means to me – that's how you do it with undergrad students – it would be permissible.

LF: In this case, it's the governor's daughter, the top employee of a major donor to the university. Would that person want to save face by walking with their cohort?

CL: The question is back in 1998. He was not the governor at the time.

JB: But he was still a prominent politician...

LF: With lots of influence.

CL: That was a decision that Paul Speaker made. I'm not sure what position Manchin had at the time.

LF: If she had completed [REDACTED], there are positive things for university to do for that. It would be done for the student, not for the university. It would be put into policy. You don't have it completed, you don't graduate. Mommy/daddy/relatives/grandma come in to see their child go through graduation, but they know they still have an incomplete to finish. That's the decision made for the student. That's my opinion.

Interview ending time: 10:55 a.m.